## **ORIGINAL**



## BEFORE THE ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION

1 2005 MAR -8 P 3: 30 2 **JEFF HATCH-MILLER** Chairman AZ CORP COMMISSION 3 MARC SPITZER DOCUMENT CONTROL Commissioner 4 WILLIAM MUNDELL Arizona Corporation Commission Commissioner DOCKETED 5 MIKE GLEASON Commissioner **KRISTIN MAYES** MAR - 8 2005 6 Commissioner 7 DOCKETED BY 8 IN THE MATTER OF OWEST DOCKET NO. T-01051B-03-0454 9 CORPORATION'S FILING AMENDED RENEWED PRICE REGULATION PLAN. 10 11 DOCKET NO. T-00000D-00-0672 IN THE MATTER OF THE 12 INVESTIGATION OF THE COST OF TELECOMMUNCIATIONS ACCESS. 13 OWEST CORPORATION'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO XO 14 **COMMUNICATIONS' APPLICATION** FOR LEAVE TO INTERVENE 15 16 Qwest Corporation ("Qwest") opposes the Application of XO Communications Services, Inc. ("XO") for Leave to Intervene ("Motion"). The Motion is untimely, and if granted will 17 18 unduly broaden the issues presented and will adversely prejudice the existing parties who have 19 been active participants in this case. 20 XO's Motion is untimely. By Procedural Order entered on July 1, 2004, the 21 Administrative Law Judge set October 9, 2004 as the deadline for filing all motions to intervene. 22 XO is now nearly five months out-of-time. 23 XO's late intervention in this case would violate principles of fundamental fairness. In 24 addition to the intervention deadline, the July 1 Procedural Order also set down an extensive 25 schedule of procedural matters. Intervenor testimony and exhibits were filed on or before 26 October 19, 2004. Subsequent dates for rebuttal testimony and exhibits, and surrebuttal

testimony and exhibits have also come and gone. Furthermore, there has been extensive discovery in this Docket. The discovery period closed January 30, 2005. Thousands upon thousands of pages of testimony, exhibits, and discovery responses have been prepared and exchanged in a timely manner during every phase of this complicated case between and among the parties who have participated. Due solely to XO's own inaction, XO has not participated in any of these phases of the case. While XO represents in its Motion that it does not seek to "unduly" broaden the nature or scope of the issues, neither Qwest, nor presumably any other party, has any knowledge of the issues XO wishes to bring forward, or what XO's positions may be on those issues. Whatever XO's issues may be, or its positions may be with respect to the issues already identified and subject to litigation in the case, are unknown to Qwest, and given the lack of opportunity for Qwest to conduct discovery, will remain unknown and not subject to any meaningful opportunity for examination.

In its Motion, XO does not suggest what should be done with respect to the discovery process. Granting the XO Motion would raise hard questions about whether the parties are obligated to share discovery with XO that has previously been served upon the other parties. Even more exacerbating, many of the discovery responses contain confidential information or highly confidential information, subject to a protective order in this docket. Qwest submits that it would be wholly unfair and would materially and adversely prejudice its position if it were required to produce its discovery responses, containing both confidential and non-confidential information, with XO at this stage of the litigation.

In its Motion, XO states as justification for its request that "as a result of recent settlement negotiations by the parties, substantive information regarding the nature of the disputes being resolved is no longer available in the public docket," and that "while XO does not intend to raise new issues in the docket, it does have an interest in knowing what issues are being addressed and resolved." XO overlooks the fact that any resolution of the issues that is proposed by parties in settlement discussions must be brought publicly before the Administrative Law

1	Judge, and subsequently before the Commission. XO will have ample opportunity to examine
2	the additional evidence that will be introduced into the record at that time and to inform the
3	Commission of its position during the public comment portion of the hearing. XO's stated
4	concern that substantive information is no longer available in the public docket due to the
5	settlement negotiations is therefore specious, and should be disregarded.
6	For the foregoing reasons, Qwest opposes XO's Motion, and requests that the
7	Commission deny it.
8	
9	DATED this 8th day of March, 2005.
10	QWEST CORPORATION
11	M = M + M
12	By: Jonga of While Old
13	Norman G. Curtright Corporate Counsel
14	4041 N. Central Ave., Suite 1100 Phoenix, Arizona 85012
15	Telephone: (602) 630-2187
16	-and-
17	Timothy Berg Theresa Dwyer
18	FENNEMORE CRAIG
19	3003 North Central Ave., Suite 2600 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2913
20	(602) 916-5421
21	Attorneys for Qwest Corporation
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	ORIGINAL and 15 copies hand-delivered for
2	filing this 8th day of March, 2005 to:
3	Docket Control
4	ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION 1200 W. Washington St.
5	Phoenix, AZ 85007
6	COPY of the foregoing delivered
7	this 8th day of March, 2005 to:
8	Jane Rodda
9	Administrative Law Judge ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
10	1200 W. Washington St. Phoenix, AZ 85007
11	Maureen A. Scott
12	Legal Division ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
13	1200 W. Washington St. Phoenix, AZ 85007
14	Ernest G. Johnson, Director
15	Utilities Division ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
16	1200 W. Washington St. Phoenix, AZ 85007
17	COPY of the foregoing mailed
18	this 8th day of March, 2005 to:
19	Joan S. Burke
20	Osborne Maledon 2929 N. Central Ave., 21 <sup>st</sup> Fl.
21	Phoenix, AZ 85067
22	Scott S. Wakefield, Chief Counsel
23	Daniel W. Pozefsky, Esq. RUCO
24	1110 West Washington, Suite 220 Phoenix, AZ 85007
25	

1	Michael W. Patten Roshka Heyman & DeWulf, PLC
2	400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 800
3	Phoenix, Arizona 85004
4	Mark A. DiNunzio Cox Arizona Telcom, LLC
5	20401 North 29 <sup>th</sup> Avenue Phoenix, Arizona 85027
6	
7	Thomas H. Campbell Michael T. Hallam
8	Lewis and Roca 40 N. Central Avenue
9	Phoenix, Arizona 85004
0	Thomas F. Dixon
1	WorldCom, Inc. 707 17 <sup>th</sup> Street, 39 <sup>th</sup> Floor
2	Denver, Colorado 80202
3	Richard S. Wolters
4	Mary Tribby AT&T
.5	1875 Lawrence Street, Room 1575 Denver, CO 80202-1847
6	Peter Q. Nyce, Jr. Regulatory Law Office
7	U.S. Army Litigation Center
8	901 N. Stuart Street, Suite 713 Arlington, VA 22203-1837
9	Daniel D. Haws
20	OSIA, Attn: ATZS-JAD USA Intelligence Center and Ft. Huachuca
21	Ft. Huachuca, AZ 85613-0600
22	Richard Lee
23	Snavely King Majoros O'Connor & Lee 1220 L. Street N.W., Suite 410
24	Washington, DC 20005
25	

1	Patrick A. Clisham
2	AT&T Arizona State Director 320 E. Broadmoor Court
3	Phoenix, AZ 85022
4	Eric S. Heath
5	Sprint Legal Division 100 Spear Street, Suite 930
6	San Francisco, CA 94105
7	Walter W. Meek President
8	Arizona Utility Investors Association 2100 N. Central Avenue, Suite 210
9	Phoenix, AZ 85004
10	Albert Sterman, Vice President
11	Arizona Consumers Council 2849 E. 8 <sup>th</sup> Street
12	Tucson, AZ 85716
13	Accipiter Communications, Inc.
14	2238 W. Lone Cactus Dr., Ste.100 Phoenix, AZ 85027
15	Alliance Group Services, Inc. 1221 Post Road East
16	Westport, CT 06880
17	Archtel, Inc.
18	1800 West Park Drive, Ste. 250 Westborough, MA 01581
19	Brooks Fiber Communications of Tucson, Inc.
20	201 Spear Street, 9 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94105
21	Centruytel
22	PO Box 4065 Monroe, LA 71211-4065
23	Citizens Utilities Rural Co. Inc.
24	Citizens Communications Co. of Arizona 4 Trial Center, Suite 200
25	Salt Lake City, UT 84180
26	

1 2	Citizens Telecommunications Co. of the White Mountains, Inc. 4 Triad Center, Ste. 200 Salt Lake City, UT 84180
3	Comm South Companies, Inc. 2909 N. Buckner Blvd., Ste. 200 Dallas, TX 75228
5	Copper Valley Telephone, Inc. PO Box 970
6	Willcox, AZ 85644
7	Electric Lightwave, Inc.
8	4 Triad Center, Ste. 200 Salt Lake City, UT 84180
9	Eschelon Telecom of Arizona, Inc. 730 Second Avenue South, Ste.1200
10	Minneapolis, MN 55402
11	Ernest Communications, Inc.
12	5275 Triangle Pkwy, Ste. 150 Norcross, GA 30092-6511
13	Intermedia Communications, Inc.
14	3608 Queen Palm Drive Tampa, FL 33619-1311
15	
16	Level 3 Communications, LLC
17	1025 Eldorado Blvd. Broomfield, CO 80021
18	Max-Tel Communications, Inc. 105 N. Wickham
19	PO Box 280
20	Alvord, TX 76225
21	MCI WorldCom Communications
22	201 Spear Street, 9 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94105
23	MCIMetro
24	201 Spear Street, 9 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94105
25	Metropolitan Fiber Systems of Arizona, Inc. 201 Spear Street, 9 <sup>th</sup> Floor
26	San Francisco, CA 94105

1	PO Box 7
2	Midvale, ID 83645
3	Navajo Communications Co., Inc. 4 Triad Center, Suite 200
4	Salt Lake City, UT 84180
5	Nextlink Long Distance Svcs. 3930 E. Watkins, Ste. 200
6	Phoenix, AZ 85034
7	North County Communications Corporation 3802 Rosencrans, Ste. 485
8	San Diego, CA 92110
9	One Point Communications Two Conway Park
10	150 Field Drive, Ste. 300 Lake Forest, IL 60045
11	
12	Opex Communications, Inc. 500 E. Higgins Rd., Ste. 200
13	Elk Grove Village, IL 60007
14	Pac-West Telecomm, Inc. 1776 W. March Lane, #250
15	Stockton, CA 95207 The Phone Company/Network Services of New Hope
16	6805 Route 202 New Hope, PA 18938
17	
18	Rio Virgin Telephone Co. Rio Virgin Telephone and Cablevision
19 20	PO Box 189 Estacada, OR 97023-000
20 21	Cauth Cantual High Talanhama Association Inc.
	South Central Utah Telephone Association, Inc. PO Box 226
22 23	Escalante, UT 84726-000
23 24	Southwestern Telephone Co., Inc. PO Box 5158 Madison, WI 53705 0158
2 <del>4</del> .	Madison, WI 53705-0158
25 26	Special Accounts Billing Group 1523 Withorn Lane

2	130 N. Main Street Butte, MT 59701
3	Table Top Telephone Co, Inc.
4	600 N. Second Avenue Ajo, AZ 85321-0000
5	TCG Phoenix
6	1875 Lawrence Street, Room 1575 Denver, CO 80202
7	Valley Telephone Cooperative, Inc. 752 E. Malley Street
8	PO Box 970 Willcox, AZ 85644
9	Wincox, AZ 63044
10	Verizon Select Services Inc. 6665 MacArthur Blvd, HQK02D84
11	Irving, TX 75039
12	VYVX, LLC One Williams Center, MD 29-1
13	Tulsa, OK 74172
14	Western CLEC Corporation
15	3650 131 <sup>st</sup> Avenue SE, Ste. 400 Bellevue, WA 98006 Williams Local Network, Inc.
16	One Williams Center, MD 29-1 Tulsa, OK 74172
17	
18	XO Arizona Inc. 3930 Watkins, Ste. 200
19	Phoenix, AZ 85034
20	
21	Diane Krypa
22	
23	
24	